

Public Document Pack



CYNGOR SIR
YNYS MÔN
ISLE OF ANGLESEY
COUNTY COUNCIL

Dr Gwynne Jones.
Prif Weithredwr – Chief Executive

CYNGOR SIR YNYS MÔN
ISLE OF ANGLESEY COUNTY COUNCIL
Swyddfeydd y Cyngor - Council Offices
LLANGFNI
Ynys Môn - Anglesey
LL77 7TW

Ffôn / tel (01248) 752500
Ffacs / fax (01248) 750839

RHYBUDD O GYFARFOD	NOTICE OF MEETING	
PWYLLGOR GWAITH (ARBENNIG)	THE EXECUTIVE (EXTRAORDINARY)	
DYDD IAU, 7 MAWRTH 2019 am 2.00 o'r gloch	THURSDAY, 7 MARCH 2019 at 2.00 pm	
SIAMBR Y CYNGOR SWYDDFEYDD Y CYNGOR LLANGFNI	COUNCIL CHAMBER COUNCIL OFFICES LLANGFNI	
Swyddog Pwyllgor	Ann Holmes 01248 752518	Committee Officer

AELODAU/MEMBERS

Plaid Cymru/Party of Wales

Llinos Medi Huws, Carwyn Jones, R Meirion Jones, Alun W Mummery, Robert G Parry, OBE, FRAGS, Robin Wyn Williams

Annibynnol/Independent

Richard Dew, Dafydd Rhys Thomas, Ieuan Williams

COPI ER GWYBODAETH / COPY FOR INFORMATION

I Aelodau'r Cyngor Sir / To the Members of the County Council

Bydd aelod sydd ddim ar y Pwyllgor Gwaith yn cael gwahoddiad i'r cyfarfod i siarad (ond nid i bleidleisio) os ydy o/hi wedi gofyn am gael rhoddi eitem ar y rhaglen dan Reolau Gweithdrefn y Pwyllgor Gwaith. Efallai bydd y Pwyllgor Gwaith yn ystyried ceisiadau gan aelodau sydd ddim ar y Pwyllgor Gwaith i siarad ar faterion eraill.

A non-Executive member will be invited to the meeting and may speak (but not vote) during the meeting, if he/she has requested the item to be placed on the agenda under the Executive Procedure Rules. Requests by non-Executive members to speak on other matters may be considered at the discretion of The Executive.

Please note that meetings of the Committee are filmed for live and subsequent broadcast on the Council's website. The Authority is a Data Controller under the Data Protection Act and data collected during this webcast will be retained in accordance with the Authority's published policy.

A G E N D A

1 DECLARATION OF INTEREST

To receive any declarations of interest from any Member or Officer in respect of any item of business.

2 SCHOOLS MODERNISATION - REPORT FOLLOWING PUBLICATION OF STATUTORY NOTICE FOR CLOSING YSGOL GYNRADD BIWMARES, EXTENDING AND REFURBISHING YSGOL LLANDEGFAN AND YSGOL LLANGOED, AND APPROVAL OF THE ORIGINAL PROPOSAL (Pages 1 - 28)

To submit a report by the Head of Learning.

3 SCHOOLS MODERNISATION - OBJECTION REPORT: YSGOL Y GRAIG AND YSGOL TALWRN (Pages 29 - 40)

To submit a report by the Head of Learning.

ISLE OF ANGLESEY COUNTY COUNCIL	
Report to:	The Executive
Date:	7March 2019
Subject:	Modernising Schools on Anglesey – Report following publication of statutory notice for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Closing Ysgol Gynradd Biwmares, extending and refurbishing Ysgol Llandegfan and Ysgol Llangoed. and approval of the original proposal
Portfolio Member(s):	Councillor R. Meirion Jones
Head of Service:	Arwyn Williams
Author of Report: Phone number: E-mail:	Emrys Bebb
Local Members:	Councillor Lewis Davies Councillor Carwyn Jones Councillor Alun Roberts

A – Recommendation(s) and Reason(s)
<p>Reasons:</p> <p>In order to conform with the School Standards and Organisation Act (Wales) 2013 and the School Organisation Code, the Authority issued a Statutory Notice of their intention:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Not to support Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris, Beaumaris, Anglesey, LL58 8HL which is currently maintained by Anglesey County Council, and extend and refurbish Ysgol Llandegfan and refurbish Ysgol Llangoed. Both of which are Welsh medium community primary schools which are maintained by Anglesey County Council. Both school will be for boys and girls aged 3-11. <p>The Statutory Notice was issued on 14 January 2019 and there was a period of 28 days to object to the proposal to follow. Therefore, the objection period ended on 10 February 2019. A total of 50 objections were received to the above proposal.</p> <p>In accordance with the School Organisation Code 2013 issued by the Welsh Government, the proposer or proposers, namely the Isle of Anglesey County Council in this case, need to issue a report describing any objections received i.e. an objection report. See the objection report in Appendix 1.</p> <p>The way the Council deals with objections to a statutory notice is in line with the procedure set out in the School Organisation Code that has been in force since October 2013.</p> <p>Therefore, in accordance with the 2013 School Organisation Code, section 5.3, the Executive Committee through this report must –</p> <p>“decide whether the proposals should be approved’, rejected or approved with adaptations.”</p>

It is recommended that the Executive:

- i. Decide to approve the original proposals namely:

To refurbish and extend Ysgol Llandegfan, close Ysgol Beaumaris and refurbish Ysgol Llangoed.

- ii. Authorise officers to continue with the process of refurbishing and extending Ysgol Llandegfan, closing Ysgol Beaumaris and refurbishing Ysgol Llangoed.

Background:

A non-statutory consultation on the options for modernising primary education provision in the Seiriol area was conducted for a period between June and July 2017. Following the Executive’s approval in October, 2017, a statutory consultation process was conducted from 20 November, 2017 until 6 February, 2018. The report regarding the result of the statutory consultation was considered by the Corporate Scrutiny Panel in its meeting held on 12 March, 2018 before the Executive considered it on 26 March 2018.

The Executive decided to “delay making a decision in regards to the modernisations of schools in the Seiriol area so that a new statutory consultation could be conducted on the proposals for primary education in the area.”

The additional statutory consultation period was conducted from 22 May 2018 until 2 July 2018. A report on the statutory consultation period was discussed by the Executive on 18 July 2018 and it was decided to:

- Approve Option 1, namely to refurbish and extend Ysgol Llandegfan, close Ysgol Beaumaris and refurbish Ysgol Llangoed.
- That discussions with pre-school childcare groups – Little Puffins and “Ti a Fi” – would be carried out soon to see what pre-school childcare provision is required in the area.
- That Cwlwm Seiriol is to be included in the post decision Stakeholder Group which will be established.

A statutory notice of the Authority’s intention to operate the proposal was issued on 22 November 2018. This meant that the objection period of more than 28 days ended on 27 December 2018 and many complained that this period ended during the Christmas holidays. Therefore, in order to provide stakeholders with additional time, an additional statutory notice was issued on 14 January 2019 and the objection period ended on 10 February 2019.

B – Which other options did you consider and what were their reasons for declining them and/or choosing this option?

28 specific options were considered in the report on the non-statutory consultation in the Seiriol area. The options were evaluated as a basis to the recommendations presented in the report and each option was scored and the reasons for disregarding some of the options were outlined in the reports on the consultation.

Additionally, 4 options proposed by stakeholders were assessed as part of the process. None of the other options scored as high as the proposal scored against the 11 criteria.

C – For what reason is this a decision for the Executive Committee?

The Executive Committee is responsible for school organisation matters.

D – Is this decision consistent with the policy approved by the full Council?

Yes

DD – Is this decision within the budget approved by the Council?

Yes – The Strategic Outline Programme plans for Band B approved by the Executive Committee in July 2017. It is foreseen that a business case for the plan above will be presented to the Executive in September / October 2019.

E – With whom did you consult?**What were their observations?**

1	Chief Executive / Senior Management Team (SMT) (mandatory)	Incorporated in this report
2	Finance / Section 151 (mandatory)	
3	Legal / Monitoring officer (mandatory)	Incorporated in this report
5	Human Resources (HR)	
6	Property	
7	Information Communication Technology (ICT)	
8	Scrutiny	See minutes of the Corporate Scrutiny Committee meetings for 13 July 2018, 12 March 2018 and 2 October 2017.
9	Local Members	Incorporated in this report
10	Any external bodies / other(s)	Incorporated in this report

F – Risks and any mitigation steps (if relevant)

1	Economic	Not applicable
2	Anti-poverty	Not applicable
3	Crime and Disorder	Not applicable
4	Environmental	Mitigation steps will be part of the planning application
5	Equalities	Not applicable
6	Result Agreements	Not applicable
7	Other	Not applicable

FF - Appendices:

Appendix 1 – Objection Report

G – Background Papers (please contact the Report author for any further information):

1. Minutes of the Executive's meetings for 18 July 2018, 26 March 2018 and 30 October 2017.
2. Minutes of the Corporate Scrutiny Committee for 13 July 2018, 12 March 2018 and 2 October 2017.
3. Non-statutory Consultation Documents, Statutory Consultation Documents and the Consultation Report
4. Strategic Outline Programme (SOP) presented to the Welsh Government in December 2013.
5. Letter by the Welsh Government dated 31 January 2014.
6. Report to the Executive dated 4 November 2013.
7. School Organisation Code 2013
8. Minutes of the consultation meetings with staff, governors and parents held in October and November 2016 and February / March 2018 and July 2018.
9. Statutory notice dated 14 January 2018.



Objection Report

1. Background

In order to comply with the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation Code 2013, the Authority issued a **Statutory Notice** of its intent to:

- Approve Option 1, namely to refurbish and extend Ysgol Llandegfan, close Ysgol Beaumaris and refurbish Ysgol Llangoed.
- That discussions with the preschool childcare groups – Little Puffins and “Ti a Fi” – take place soon to establish the pre-school childcare provision required in the area.
- That Cwlwm Seiriol is included in the post-decision Stakeholder Group to be established.

The **Statutory Notice** was issued on the 14 January 2019 and there was a period of 28 days to object to the following proposal. Therefore, the objection period expired on the 10 February 2019. **A total of 50 objections to the proposal above were received.**

Under section 49 of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013, proposers must announce a summary of the statutory objections and respond to those objections (“the objection report”) – which is this document.

The statutory notice was initially published on 22 November 2018. This meant that the objection period of more than 28 days ended on 27 December 2018 and many objected to this period ending during the Christmas holidays. Therefore, to give stakeholders additional time, an additional statutory notice was published on 14 January 2019 and the objection period ended on 10 February 2019.

2. Objections

Outlined below is the Authority’s response to the points raised as objections:

Objection Report

Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections
<p>1. Timing of the notice prior to the Christmas holidays was "cynical"</p>	<p>The decision to close Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris was made by the Authority's Executive on 18 July 2018. A period of 26 weeks from the end of the statutory consultation period is permitted for the proposer (the Isle of Anglesey County Council in this case) to publish a statutory proposal i.e. by 30 December 2018. In the meantime, officers were developing the plans for Ysgol Llandegfan and Ysgol Llangoed. Extending the 26 week period was not thought to have been necessary. However, as many respondents complained about the timing of the publication of the proposal, an extension was sought and granted by Welsh Government and a further notice was published on 14 January 2019.</p>
<p>2. "Closing the school would have a "significant impact on the town and its residents" and "would be devastating". Closing the school would also "compound social and demographic issues" in the town. Amenities "in the town are fantastic". The Council should think of the future of the community</p>	<p>The closure of the school could have an impact on the attractiveness of the local area for proposed house buyers. Conversely, local residents could consider that not having a school in a specific area would be a useful thing making the area more attractive for home buyers looking for a quieter neighbourhood. Neither a positive or negative effect is suggested here but the possibility for residents' profile over time is acknowledged. These issues were discussed in the Community Impact Assessment issued with the statutory consultation document on 22 May 2018.</p>
<p>3. That "the decision was a political one" and that the Seiriol area "deserves a new school"</p>	<p>The decision by the Authority's Executive on 18 July 2018 to close Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris was based in the issues detailed in the report on the statutory consultation. A new school was considered for the Seiriol area and this possibility was assessed and scored</p>

Objection Report

	<p>long with many other options. This possible option of a new school for Seiriol scored was assessed and scored along with many other options against 11 factors as outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land <p>This possible option scored 71 points compared to 79 for the favoured options i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points)</p>
<p>4. That stakeholders did not receive “formal notification” of the issuing of the statutory notice.</p>	<p>In line with the School Organisation Code, a link to the statutory notice was sent to all stakeholders including the governing body of all three schools (Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris, Ysgol Llandegfan and Ysgol Llangoed). This was done on each occasion the statutory notice was republished.</p>

Objection Report

<p>5. That Ysgol Llangoed should be closed and transferred “to Beaumaris” as it “is the most cost effective and sensible thing to do” and that closing Ysgol Beaumaris and extending “Ysgol Llangoed is and will be a waste of money” and could “remain unused”. Additionally, some think that parents “will not send their children to Llangoed”.</p>	<p>This possible option of closing Ysgol Llangoed and transferring the pupils to Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris was assessed and scored along with many other options against 11 factors as outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land <p>This possible option scored 64 points compared to 79 for the favoured options i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points)</p>
<p>6. That the Council has not considered alternative ideas and “ignored the wonderful opportunity to combine the elderly residents of the proposed new extra care facility (If it is</p>	<p>In the report on the non-statutory consultation, a total of 20 options were assessed and scored. Two options scored the highest i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points)</p>

Objection Report

<p>ever built) with the children of the school". Parents ready to do so</p>	<p>Following the statutory consultation of 20 November 2017 until 6 February 2018, the Beaumaris Primary School Response Committee presented four alternatives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Close Ysgol Llangoed and modernise Ysgol Beaumaris to become Ysgol Bro Seiriol B. Reduce Ysgol Beaumaris in size and use part of the building for a nursery or other educational provision. C. Develop a very different educational offer at Ysgol Beaumaris to attract more pupils from the area, based on adventure, mindfulness and creativity. D. Develop an innovative model where pupils from Ysgol Beaumaris and older people from the extra care facility learn together and undertake shared activities. <p>The alternative options were scored by the Authority's officers in response to the alternative options received by Ysgol Beaumaris Governing Body. The advantages, disadvantages and risks if each option were considered and each was appraised financially. The assessment of these options was fully outlined in the report on the statutory consultation which was issued in July 2018.</p>
<p>7. That the statutory notice had not been communicated to parents</p>	<p>In line with the School Organisation Code, a link to the statutory notice was sent to all stakeholders including the governing body of all three schools (Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris, Ysgol Llandegfan and Ysgol Llangoed). This was done on each occasion the statutory notice was republished.</p>
<p>8. That the Council was not keeping to the School Organisation Code – no notice to parents and governors</p>	<p>As of 21 January 2019, an IoACC officer has placed the statutory notice (dated 14 January 2019) on the entrances of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris. Even though IoACC officers had requested that the Headteacher place the statutory notice at the requisite locations, this had not been done.</p>

Objection Report

<p>9. Pupils objected in an article about wanting Santa’s support in fighting the closure of their school.</p>	<p>A total of 22 objection letters and drawings followed by an article about wanting Santa’s support in fighting the closure of their school were received from the pupils of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris pupils in December 2018.</p>
<p>10. Some feel that there is no choice as to where to send their children as the notice “states that Ysgol Llangoed is the mandatory school” and that the “date of closure” has changed.</p>	<p>The School Standards and Framework Act 1998 allows parents to choose which school their child attends. Ysgol Llangoed is the school designated by the Authority to which children from Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris would move to when it closes. The Authority would then provide transport to these pupils to Ysgol Llangoed.</p> <p>The implementation date of the proposals has been changed to allow additional work to be conducted on Ysgol Llandegfan.</p>
<p>11. That the Authority has not followed the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act 2015</p>	<p>The Well-being of Future Generations Act (2015) was considered as part of the statutory consultation. The Impact Assessment, which accompanied the statutory consultation document, outlined how it was anticipated the proposal under consideration would contribute to the 7 Well-being goals. The Community Impact Assessment also assessed the possible effects of the proposal on the Community, as noted by the stakeholders.</p>
<p>12. The Scrutiny Committee of 2 October 2017, 12 March 2018 and 13 July 2018 and August 2018 not correctly constituted</p>	<p>The Corporate Scrutiny Committee did not have 2 parent governor representatives and 1 representative of other faiths or denominations as per the Constitution on the dates specified. However, the role of the Corporate Scrutiny Committee on the 13 July 2018 was to consider all relevant facts and make recommendations to the Executive for its meeting on 18 July 2018. A comprehensive public report was submitted to the Committee and all relevant facts presented including feedback from stakeholders. Public consultation was extensive and met necessary statutory requirements- this included a total of 9 public meetings in the Seiriol ward between June 2017 and June 2018.</p>

Objection Report

<p>13. That the Council has missed an opportunity here to strengthen Ysgol Beaumaris pupil base by allowing the Cylch Ti a Fi to work collaboratively with the school to provide a wraparound facility that would utilise existing buildings thereby reducing surplus spaces and making more efficient use of resources.</p>	<p>With school modernisation projects in the past, the Authority has waited until after the objection period before setting up a stakeholder group. Discussions with groups such as Little Puffins and Ti a Fi will commence following the objection period.</p>
<p>14. Some stakeholders object to the cost of closure of the school and the building being destroyed</p>	<p>The cost of each of the 20 options for the Seiriol area was one of the factors considered in the report on the non-statutory consultation process. As outlined below:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land

Objection Report

	<p>A new primary school for the Seiriol area was forecast to cost £7.3 million. The option chosen will be much less and Welsh Government will fund 65% of the project. It is not proposed to destroy the school but that it would be developed sympathetically.</p>
<p>15. The option to build a new school was not looked at thoroughly enough / Beaumaris should be considered as a super school / CSYM to invest in a new school on a new site within Beaumaris</p>	<p>This option was considered for the Seiriol area in the report on the non-statutory consultation process. The possibility of a new school was assessed and scored along with many other options. This possible option of a new school for Seiriol scored was assessed and scored along with many other options against 11 factors as outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land <p>This possible option scored 71 points compared to 79 for the favoured options i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points)</p>

Objection Report

<p>16. A stakeholder disagreed with repair and maintenance costs being used as a reason to close the school. Disagreed with pupil numbers being used as a reason to close the school as these are “increasing”.</p>	<p>The maintenance backlog cost is the cost associated with bringing the condition of the building up to the expected condition that is safe for pupils, staff, parents and other school users i.e. work that conforms to statutory health and safety standards. This is calculated by qualified surveyors following a structural survey of the school. The maintenance backlog was one of several factors considered by the Executive when making the decision to close Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris on 18 July 2018. Pupil numbers whilst forecast to increase slightly will remain low compared to pupils number in 1996 for example.</p>
<p>17. Council should not have stated “that if Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris was to remain open and share a site with the [extra care] facility that it would have to shut for 2 years”.</p>	<p>If this option was to have been chosen, it was vital for Anglesey County Council to state this as it would be a consequence of selecting this option. Pupil safety during any potential work on an active school is of paramount importance to Anglesey County Council.</p>
<p>18. Reconsider the decision to close the school – site of Ysgol Beaumaris is better than the other 2 schools / Reconsider the decision and close both Llangoed and Llandegfan and renovate Beaumaris. Only need to consider cost of one school to run.</p>	<p>This option was assessed along with many other options in the report on the non-statutory consultation process outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel

Objection Report

	<p>10. Costs 11. Availability of land</p> <p>However, this option did not score as highly as the favoured option i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points)</p>
<p>19. Roads to Ysgol Llangoed and Ysgol Llandegfan are not suitable “as both roads are closed frequently due to flooding and bad weather conditions”. Congestion and environmental concerns</p>	<p>Traffic and travel issues will be addressed as part of a Traffic Impact Assessment that is carried out for each new project. The Authority's view is that the development of possible transport plans in the Seiriol area would prejudice any recommendations or decisions that Council officers and independent contractors might make. Therefore, a Traffic Impact Assessment will be conducted prior to the implementation date of the proposal.</p> <p>The calculations in the report on the non-statutory consultation show that bus use would not have a greater impact on the environment than the closure of Ysgol Beaumaris. Section 12 of the report on the non-statutory consultation contained information on environmental aspects.</p>
<p>20. The Authority is happy to send the pupils from Ysgol Beaumaris to Ysgol Llangoed. Yet, Ysgol Llangoed “had the school play on their yard as the hall is not big enough”. They felt the Authority was happy to squeeze more children into</p>	<p>This option was assessed along with many other options in the report on the non-statutory consultation process outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues

Objection Report

<p>Ysgol Llangoed whereas Beaumaris has plenty more room for more children and land to expand”.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land <p>However, this option did not score as highly as the favoured option i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points)</p>
<p>21. No consideration given to a potential increase in pupils due to the Wylfa Newydd project</p>	<p>During the whole consultation processes, IoACC officers stated that no decision had been made to give permission for the Wylfa Newydd project to proceed. Therefore, until the final go ahead was given, IoACC could not formally include the possible effect of additional pupils requiring their education at schools on Anglesey in pupil projections. At the time of writing this report, the project has unfortunately been put on hold and IoACC officers will, at least for the time being, not be considering the potential effect of Wylfa Newydd due to the project being put on hold.</p>
<p>22. Beaumaris would be the only town in Wales without a school and “the long history of education in the town is being ignored”. School is in the only borough in Anglesey</p>	<p>There is no statutory requirement for a town to have a school. The current issues facing Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris were detailed in the report on the statutory consultation and members of the Executive were fully aware of the history of education in the Seiriol area when making their decision on 18 July 2018.</p>
<p>23. No discussions with Little</p>	<p>With school modernisation projects in the past, the Authority has waited until after the objection</p>

Objection Report

<p>Puffins and Ti a Fi, Status of post decision stakeholder group</p>	<p>period before setting up a stakeholder group. Discussions with groups such as Little Puffins and Ti a Fi will then commence.</p>
<p>24. It is unlikely parents will send their children to Ysgol Llangoed but would instead send them to other primary schools on Anglesey or Bangor.</p>	<p>This was also said at the consultation meetings. In accordance with national law, parents can choose which school their child will attend. As noted above, the Authority's officers did not proceed further in terms of transport plans for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An attempt to estimate where pupils from any school that could close would prejudice any decision by the Executive. <p>Regardless of the Executive's decision on 18 July 2018, traffic and travel issues will be addressed as part of a Traffic Impact Assessment that is carried out for each new project. The Authority's view is that the development of possible transport plans in the Seiriol area would prejudice any recommendations or decisions that Council officers and independent contractors might make.</p>
<p>25. Proposal disregards the economy of the area</p>	<p>The Community Impact Assessment assessed the potential effect of closing the school on the community. The closure of the school could have an impact on the attractiveness of the local area for proposed house buyers. Conversely, local residents could consider that not having a school in a specific area would be a useful thing making the area more attractive for home buyers looking for a quieter neighbourhood. Neither a positive or negative effect is suggested here but the possibility for residents' profile over time is acknowledged. These issues were discussed in the Community Impact Assessment issued with the statutory consultation document on 22 May 2018.</p>

26 February 2019

Appendix 1

Objection Report

<p>26. IoACC did not engage with governors re alternative proposals</p>	<p>The Authority accepted the additional options proposed by the Beaumaris Primary School Response Committee and fully assessed them along with the 20 other possible options even though there it did not have to do so.</p>
<p>27. Consultation with children tokenistic</p>	<p>The School Organisation Code states: “As a minimum, [consultation with pupils] must include consultation with the school councils of the affected schools”. This was done in all 3 schools involved in this proposal.</p> <p>It was explained to the pupils at the meetings that a consultation had taken place with the adults in the community, and that this was an opportunity for the children from the schools to express their opinions regarding the Council’s plans for modernising schools. It was emphasised that their opinion was important because they were the ones attending the schools. They were told that the information they gave would be transferred to a report which would be presented to the Council’s Councillors as part of the Statutory Consultation.</p> <p>It was explained that the reasons for modernising were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are too many vacant places or not enough places in some schools in Anglesey • It was necessary to make sure that all pupils had a good education • It was necessary to make sure that the school is modern and offers good equipment • That the Council spends its money on schools in a fair way <p>The children were asked the following questions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What did the pupils like about their present school? 2. What is your opinion of the proposal to close Ysgol Biwmares, and transfer the children to Ysgol Llangoed or Ysgol Llandegfan? 3. Did they agree with the reasons for change? 4. Any other comments

26 February 2019

Appendix 1

Objection Report

<p>28. Misleading information and factual inaccuracies in the document</p>	<p>The School Organisation Code 2013 outlines the information required in the consultation documentation. Every effort has been made to ensure the accuracy of this information.</p>
<p>29. Community impact assessment insufficient / “IoACC has not fulfilled their duty to consider the wider impact of the school closure”</p>	<p>The School Organisation Code 2013 outlines the information required for the Community Impact Assessments and the Authority adhered to these during the statutory consultation process as required by law.</p>
<p>30. Children won’t be able to walk to school or go to a local school</p>	<p>It is not possible for every child to be able to walk to school. Other primary schools on the Island exist where children can’t walk to school. Children are guided to those schools in a variety of ways. Traffic and travel issues will be addressed as part of a Traffic Impact Assessment carried out for each new project.</p>
<p>31. Concern for child moving to another school.</p>	<p>As described above, many factors were assessed by the Executive prior to making its decision on 18 July 2018. When any child moves to another school, he or she will receive the same standard of care. However, if a child has Additional Learning Needs (ALN) and a Statement that identifies a child's Special Educational Needs (SEN), then the aim of the Statement is to ensure that the child receives the right support to enable him / her to make progress in the school. This Statement would remain valid for any child in question regardless of the school attended.</p>
<p>32. The statutory consultation document did not state “that when Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris will close, the pupils will transfer to Ysgol Llangoed by 1 May 2021, subject to parental choice and in</p>	<p>The School Standards and Framework Act 1998 allows parents to choose which school their child attends. Ysgol Llangoed is the school designated by the Authority to which children from Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris would move to when it closes. The Authority would then provide transport to these pupils to Ysgol Llangoed. The implementation date of the proposals has been changed to allow additional work to be</p>

Objection Report

<p>accordance with the Authority's Schools' Admission Policy at the time. Ysgol Llandegfan and Ysgol Llangoed will continue to be Welsh medium community primary schools.</p>	<p>conducted on Ysgol Llandegfan.</p>
<p>33. Land of the school was originally designated to use for a school for Beaumaris Pupil numbers increasing / Beaumaris School should be made smaller and refurbished, with room for more pupils, as the predicted numbers of children increases./ If school not threatened for so long, numbers would have increased</p>	<p>There is no reverter on the site of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris i.e. there is no conditional clause in the deeds of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris to state that it should revert to its original purpose if the site is sold. This option to make Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris smaller and refurbish it was assessed in the report on the non-statutory consultation document against 11 factors as outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land <p>This possible option scored 72 points compared to 79 for the favoured options i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two</p>

Objection Report

	<p>other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points) Below is a table of the number of pupils at Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris over the past few years:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="779 566 2101 654"> <thead> <tr> <th>1996</th> <th>2001</th> <th>2006</th> <th>2007</th> <th>2008</th> <th>2009</th> <th>2010</th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>189</td> <td>144</td> <td>108</td> <td>124</td> <td>117</td> <td>103</td> <td>90</td> <td>92</td> <td>81</td> <td>71</td> <td>56</td> <td>50</td> <td>39</td> <td>40</td> <td>42</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>The decline in numbers started over 20 years ago and clearly, demography is a factor here.</p>	1996	2001	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	189	144	108	124	117	103	90	92	81	71	56	50	39	40	42
1996	2001	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018																	
189	144	108	124	117	103	90	92	81	71	56	50	39	40	42																	
<p>34. L.A has not explored the possibility of making YGB ‘shine’ in the C21 by using grants.</p>	<p>Each of the 20 options mentioned in the report on the non-statutory consultation process was assessed and scored. Each option was assessed and scored along with many other options against 11 factors as outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel 10. Costs 11. Availability of land <p>All the options were assessed from a financial point of view using factor 10 above. Whichever</p>																														

Objection Report

	<p>option that would have scored highest would have been pursued by IoACC and a business case would have been compiled.</p>
<p>35. Conducting the “consultation on the closure of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris at the same time as the consultation on the Shared Care Facility” meant “local people became confused and the old and the young were set up to fight against each other”.</p>	<p>The non-statutory consultation document issued in June 2017 is was not the intention stated: “Work to share information regarding the Council’s preferred option for an Extra Care site in the Seiriol area will take place in the next few months. The preferred site is the Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris site. Developing possible Extra Care facilities on this site will not affect the result of the consultation on the future of Ysgol Beaumaris. It is foreseen that this development can be located on the same site as the present school conditional upon usual considerations.” Therefore, both consultations were conducted simultaneously for potential stakeholders to obtain information on both consultations within a short period of time. There was no sinister purpose in doing this.</p>
<p>36. IoACC was “in a rush to get the school closure through just before the law changes. By doing this the council may have appeared to obey the letter of the law but are disregarding the mood of the nation and the intentions of the government, which is passing laws to protect such schools.</p>	<p>The revised School Organisation Code came into force on 1 November 2018 which was before the date of this objection. However, this revision of the Code is not retrospective and the Authority is adhering to the Code. It should be noted, however, that this is a presumption against closure, and the revised Code of Procedure does not say that rural schools should not close. Indeed, the Code of Organisation states that there is a priority to provide high quality education in small and rural schools, and indeed recognizes that education is the main consideration. Page 3 of the revised School Organisation Code states: “If a proposer has commenced consultation before 1 November 2018 the proposal must be published and determined in accordance with the first edition of the Code. Consultation will be considered to have commenced where a consultation document has been published”.</p>

Objection Report

<p>37. “The Council doesn’t listen to our views”</p>	<p>As stated in the consultation documents, the Authority is always keen to hear the views of stakeholders on the way forward with regard to the primary education provision in the Seiriol area. No decision had been made until feedback from stakeholders was received as part of the non-statutory and statutory consultation processes. Reports on the consultation processes were presented to the Executive for it to make its decisions.</p> <p>The Authority has to consider many factors in reaching its decision and it is accepted that it will be impossible to please everybody.</p>
<p>38. Some enquired as to “what had happened to YGB’s’ maintenance budget”?</p>	<p>The maintenance budget for Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris is allocated annually according to a formula. This is done in the same way for each primary school on Anglesey. However, the maintenance backlog for Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris is high.</p>
<p>39. IoACC has applied for de-listing “when it suits you”</p>	<p>Anglesey County Council has not applied for de-listing of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris. However, Anglesey County Council has asked the conservation body in Wales i.e. CADW about de-listing the school but CADW would not allow that to happen. Therefore, whatever happens to the building on the future, any changes that need to be made to it will require CADW’s permission.</p>
<p>40. IoACC should build a new school on the Lairds site along with mixed housing “comprising affordable and social housing and light industrial units”</p>	<p>The Lairds site is not in the Joint Local Development Plan for it to be developed.</p>

Objection Report

<p>41. Closing YGB will “undermine the attractiveness of living in the north eastern end of the Llanfairpwll-Beaumaris commuter belt and people will make decisions to live on the mainland”.</p>	<p>The closure of the school could have an impact on the attractiveness of the local area for proposed house buyers. Conversely, local residents could consider that not having a school in a specific area would be a useful thing making the area more attractive for home buyers looking for a quieter neighbourhood. Neither a positive or negative effect is suggested here but the possibility for residents' profile over time is acknowledged. These issues were discussed in the Community Impact Assessment which was issued with the statutory consultation document on 22 May 2018.</p>
<p>42. A long term vision “for the south east of Anglesey” is needed</p>	<p>The Council has been working on this along with local elected members for several months and is working with 5 wards to develop a Place Plan. This will be done in Seiriol soon. The Seiriol League (Cynghrair Seiriol) is also a success.</p>
<p>43. “The Authority had made its mind up beforehand”</p>	<p>As stated in the consultation documents, the Authority is always keen to hear the views of stakeholders on the way forward with regard to the primary education provision in the Seiriol area. No decision had been made until feedback from stakeholders was received as part of the non-statutory and statutory consultation processes. Reports on the consultation processes were presented to the Executive for it to make its decisions.</p>
<p>44. My child is “happy and involved in the school” and parents did not want to have to transfer their child(ren) to another school / family wished to bring their child up in Beaumaris but will be unlikely to do so now. I chose Beaumaris to send her child because of the caring,</p>	<p>As described above, many factors were assessed by the Executive prior to making its decision on 18 July 2018. When any moves to another school, he or she will receive the same standard of care. However, if a child has Additional Learning Needs (ALN) and a Statement that identifies a child's Special Educational Needs (SEN) and any additional support the child should receive, then the aim of the Statement is to ensure that the child receives the right support to enable him / her to make progress in the school. This Statement would remain valid for any child in question regardless of the school attended.</p>

Objection Report

<p>nurturing environment that she had witnessed whilst her child was attending Little Puffins Playgroup</p>	
<p>45. Some disagreed with the maintenance backlog figures</p>	<p>The maintenance backlog cost is the cost associated with bringing the condition of the building up to the expected condition that is safe for pupils, staff, parents and other school users i.e. work that conforms to statutory health and safety standards. The sum for Ysgol Beaumaris reflects the condition grade [C] which notes that there are several defects requiring attention at the school.</p>
<p>46. “Seems perverse that IoACC should be taking steps to weaken the ability of a settlement (i.e. Beaumaris) to fulfil the role expected of it by the strategic planning system”</p>	<p>There is no requirement for local development plans to “provide education”. Local planning authorities prepare local development plans that provide a statutory policy framework, which is applied to proposals that require planning consent to develop land and buildings in the plan area during a specific 15 year period. Planning consent is not required to close schools. But, for example, if the evidence base available during the preparation of a local development plan demonstrates a need to safeguard land for a new school, then the Plan should include a policy that facilitates the development of that new school, and should allocate land set aside by the Council for that new school on the Plan’s proposals maps.</p> <p>The comment seems to be alluding to Beaumaris’ role in the Anglesey and Gwynedd Joint Local Development Plan. Beaumaris is identified as a Local Service Centre in the Plan’s Settlement Strategy. When local planning authorities prepare their local development plans they undertake settlement assessments to inform decisions about policies regarding where development should be spatially located to achieve a sustainable pattern of growth. The assessments look at the role and function of places, which includes collecting information about facilities and services located</p>

Objection Report

	<p>within each settlement. This work was undertaken to formulate the Plan's Settlement Strategy and its Spatial Strategy. The methodology used to assess each settlement's role and function included collecting information about services and facilities available at that point in time within each town and village. The services and facilities looked at included primary schools. But it also looked at employment provision, retail provision and transport opportunities. Having applied a scoring system Beaumaris was considered to align with the definition of a Local Service Centre in terms of its role and function within the Plan area. Therefore, the presence of a primary school in Beaumaris at the Plan preparation stage was only one of several matters considered, and was not the determining factor.</p>
<p>47. Federalisation would be an easier option</p>	<p>Federating was considered in 3 of the 20 options considered in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely options 8, 14 and 17. All three of these options scored lower than the option which became the favoured options. These possible options were assessed and scored along with many other options against 11 factors as outlined in the report on the non-statutory consultation process namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Raise educational standards 2. Reduce the number of empty places 3. Reduce the variance in cost per pupil 4. Ensure that school buildings create the best possible learning environment 5. Ensure that school buildings are in a good condition and that there are no health and safety issues 6. Increase the leadership capacity 7. Community use of the school building 8. Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 9. Geographical factors and travel

Objection Report

	<p>10. Costs 11. Availability of land</p> <p>This possible options scored as follows: Option 8 – 64 points; Option 14 – 73 points; Option 17 - 68 points This compared to 79 for the favoured options i.e. Option 2 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools, renovate both and perhaps federalize (79 points) Option 3 - Close Ysgol Beaumaris and give the parents a choice to send their children to the two other schools and review the catchments (79 points) The federation of the 2 schools would not address surplus places, the condition of the buildings or necessarily lead to financial savings.</p>																														
<p>48. The Local Education Authority has over a period of time strategically worked to decrease number of children in the school.</p>	<p>Every Head-teacher is appointed to the post following a rigorous interview process and if the successful candidate has met pre-determined criteria. “Reducing numbers” at a school is most certainly not one of these criteria. Indeed funding for each school is partly dependent on pupil numbers and therefore, Head-teachers would want to encourage pupils to attend their school rather than reduce numbers. It should also be noted that Governors are responsible for Head-teacher appointment.</p>																														
<p>49. For many years the future of the school has been put into doubt and parents, concerned to see their children go to one primary school for 7 years, have often chosen other schools in and out of the area from the start, in order to secure a place</p>	<p>Below is a table of the number of pupils at Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris over the past few years:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="779 1161 2101 1251"> <thead> <tr> <th>1996</th> <th>2001</th> <th>2006</th> <th>2007</th> <th>2008</th> <th>2009</th> <th>2010</th> <th>2011</th> <th>2012</th> <th>2013</th> <th>2014</th> <th>2015</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>189</td> <td>144</td> <td>108</td> <td>124</td> <td>117</td> <td>103</td> <td>90</td> <td>92</td> <td>81</td> <td>71</td> <td>56</td> <td>50</td> <td>39</td> <td>40</td> <td>42</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>The decline in numbers started over 20 years ago and clearly, demography is a factor here.</p>	1996	2001	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	189	144	108	124	117	103	90	92	81	71	56	50	39	40	42
1996	2001	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018																	
189	144	108	124	117	103	90	92	81	71	56	50	39	40	42																	

Objection Report

<p>'before a rush begins'.</p>	
<p>50. “Has the school been in 'special measures'? This has resulted in reducing the pupil numbers at the school. Numbers now are inevitably dwindling due to the council's plans to close the school.</p>	<p>Estyn conducted an inspection of Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris in January 2014. As outlined in the report on the statutory consultation document, the school was given an Adequate grading on the 3 key questions and placed in an Estyn monitoring category. Estyn returned for a monitoring visit in March 2015 and stated in its report: “It is judged that Ysgol Gynradd Beaumaris has made good progress regarding the key matters for action following Estyn’s visit in March 2015. We will now take the school’s name away from the list of schools that need to be monitored by Estyn. There will not be more monitoring visits by Estyn in relation to this inspection.”</p>

This page is intentionally left blank

ISLE OF ANGLESEY COUNTY COUNCIL	
Report to:	The Executive
Date:	7 March 2019
Subject:	School Modernisation – Objection Report ,Ysgol y Graig and Ysgol Talwrn
Portfolio Member(s):	Councillor R. Meirion Jones
Head of Service:	Arwyn Williams
Author of Report: E-mail:	Carol Sorahan carolsorahan@ynysmon.gov.uk
Local Members:	Councillor Bob Parry Councillor Dylan Rees Councillor Nicola Roberts

A – Recommendation(s) and Reason(s)
<p>Reasons: In order to conform with the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation Code 2013, the Council issued a Statutory Notice on the 14 January 2019 of their intention to:</p> <p>a. Increase the capacity of Ysgol Y Graig to accommodate pupils from Ysgol Talwrn and that Ysgol Talwrn be closed.</p> <p>The statutory notice was published on 14 January 2019 with a 28 day objection period ending on the 10 February 2019.</p> <p>A total of 23 objections were received to the above proposal.</p> <p>In order to comply with the School standards and Organisation(Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation code 2013: The proposer (The Council) must publish a summary of all objections made and its response to those objections.i.e the objection report.The objection report is available in Appendix 1.</p> <p>The way the Council deals with objections to a statutory notice is in line with the procedure set out in the School Organisation Code that has been in force since October 2013.</p> <p>In accordance with the 2013 School Organisation Code 2013, section 5.3, the Executive needs to “decide whether the proposals should be approved’, rejected or approved with adaptations.”</p> <p>Recommendation</p> <p>After considering the objections, it is recommended that the Executive approve the original proposal:</p> <p>To increase the capacity of Ysgol y Graig to accommodate pupils form Ysgol Talwrn, and that Ysgol Talwrn be closed.</p>

This to be done by:

- Using the existing building for Key Stage 2 i.e. years 3 to 6 and adapting it;
- Building a new “Block” for the Foundation Phase, namely Nursery, Reception, Years 1 and 2;
- Considering relocating the Flying Start provision within the Ysgol y Graig campus.

The new “block” would be part of Ysgol y Graig and would not be a separate unit.

Elected Members noted in their original decision that the new arrangement should operate as one school and not as two separate units.

B – Which other options did you consider and what were their reasons for declining them and/or choosing this option?

The background to the school modernisation of the Llangefni area and options considered is presented in Executive meeting date order below:

Executive Meeting :19 December 2016

Originally, 21 options were considered by the Executive at its meeting on 19 December 2016 for the provision of primary education in the Llangefni area, and the reasons for disregarding some options in the consultation reports were outlined.

The 21 options appraisal is available in the report, on the following link :

<http://democracy.anglesey.gov.uk/documents/s10955/School%20Modernisation%20-%20Llangefni%20area.pdf?LLL=0>

The Council's Executive authorised officers to continue with the statutory consultation process, and consult on **Options A and B** as outlined below to modernise the provision of primary education in the Llangefni area. The statutory consultation was held between the 31 January 2017 and 13 March 2017.

Option A

This would be based on:

Option 3- Build a new school to replace Ysgol Corn Hir and Ysgol Bodffordd.

Option 6a-Build a new primary school in Gaerwen on an alternative site, to accommodate 150 pupils. A replacement to the current Ysgol Esceifiog

Option 7 - Extend Ysgol y Graig to accommodate the pupils of Ysgol Talwrn. Close Ysgol Talwrn.

Further consultation will be required on the option of extending Ysgol y Graig to accommodate pupils from Ysgol Talwrn, and close Ysgol Talwrn

Option 9- Adaptions to Ysgol Henblas

Option B

This would be based on:

Option 3-Build a new school to replace Ysgol Corn Hir ac Ysgol Bodffordd.

Option 8 - Adaptations to Ysgol Esceifiog

Option 7 - Extend Ysgol y Graig to accommodate the pupils of Ysgol Talwrn. Close Ysgol Talwrn

Further consultation will be required on the option of extending Ysgol y Graig to accommodate pupils from Ysgol Talwrn, and close Ysgol Talwrn

Option 9- Adaptations to Ysgol Henblas

Both of the above options could also include federating Ysgol Henblas with another school. The difference between Option A and B applies to Ysgol Esceifiog.

Executive Meeting :17 July 2017

Following local and general elections, the Executive decided at its meeting on 17 July 2017 that a further consultation was needed on the option to adapt Ysgol y Graig to make space for pupils from Ysgol Talwrn, and close Ysgol Talwrn which took place from 26 September 2017 to 13 November 2017.

Executive Meeting: 26 March 2018

As a pause and review period followed from 18 December 2017 to 9 February 2018, the report on the statutory consultation (26 September 2017- 13 November 2017) was late being presented.

In order to comply with the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation Code 2013, a report on the statutory consultation must be published within 13 weeks of the consultation end date. In this respect the Executive decided:

“That a decision with regard to the modernisation of schools in the Llangefni area in relation to Ysgol y Graig and Ysgol Talwrn be deferred until a new statutory consultation process is completed”.

The new statutory consultation period was between 1 May 2018 and 18 June 2018.

Executive Meeting :16 July 2018

Following a further consultation period(1 May 2018-18 June 2018), the Executive on the 16 July 2018 resolved that:

The capacity of Ysgol y Graig be increased to accommodate pupils from Ysgol Talwrn, and that Ysgol Talwrn be closed.

This is to be done by:

- Using the existing building for Key Stage 2 i.e. years 3 to 6 and adapting it;
- Building a new “Block” for the Foundation Phase, namely Nursery, Reception, Years 1 and 2;
- Considering relocating the Flying Start provision within the Ysgol y Graig campus.

(The new “block” would be part of Ysgol y Graig and would not be a separate unit.

Elected Members noted that the new arrangement should operate as one school and not as two separate units.)

C – For what reason is this a decision for the Executive Committee?

The Executive is responsible for school organisation matters.

D – Is this decision consistent with the policy approved by the full Council?

Yes

DD – Is this decision within the budget approved by the Council?

Yes – The combined Strategic Outline Case (SOC) / Outline Business Case (OBC) was approved by the Executive on the 26 November 2018, and subsequently by the Welsh Government on the 12 February 2019.

E – With whom did you consult?		What were their observations?
1	Chief Executive / Senior Management Team (SMT) (mandatory)	Incorporated in this report
2	Finance / Section 151 (mandatory)	
3	Legal / Monitoring officer (mandatory)	Incorporated in this report
5	Human Resources (HR)	
6	Property	
7	Information Communication Technology (ICT)	
8	Scrutiny	Corporate Scrutiny minutes for 12 March 2018 and 5 July 2018
9	Local Members	Incorporated in this report
10	Any external bodies / other(s)	Incorporated in this report
F – Risks and any mitigation steps (if relevant)		
1	Economic	Not applicable
2	Anti-poverty	Not applicable
3	Crime and Disorder	Not applicable
4	Environmental	Mitigation steps will be part of the planning application
5	Equalities	Not applicable
6	Result Agreements	Not applicable
7	Other	

FF - Appendices:

Appendix 1 – Objection Report

G – Background Papers (please contact the Report author for any further information):

1. Minutes of the Executive’s meetings for 19 December 2016, 17 July 2017, 26 March 2018 and 16 July 2018.
2. Minutes of the Corporate Scrutiny Committee for 12 March 2018 and 5 July 2018.
3. Non-statutory Consultation Documents, Statutory Consultation Documents and the Consultation Report.
4. Strategic Outline Programme (SOP) presented to the Welsh Government in December 2013.
5. School Organisation Code 2013.
6. Statutory notice dated 14 January 2018.

Objection Report-Ysgol y Graig and Ysgol Talwrn

1. Background

In order to comply with the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and the School Organisation Code 2013, the Authority issued a **Statutory Notice** of its intent to:

Increase the capacity of Ysgol Y Graig to accommodate pupils from Ysgol Talwrn and that Ysgol Talwrn be closed.

The **Statutory Notice** was issued on the 14 January 2019 and there was a period of 28 days to object to the proposal. Therefore, the objection period expired on the 10 February 2019.

A total of 23 objections in the form of letters and e-mails to the proposal above were received.

Under section 49 of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013, proposers must announce a summary of the statutory objections and respond to those objections (“the objection report”) – which is this document.

The statutory notice was initially published on 22 November 2018. This meant that the objection period of more than 28 days ended on 27 December 2018 . Many stakeholders objected to this period ending during the Christmas holidays.

Therefore, to give stakeholders additional time, an additional statutory notice was published on 14 January 2019 and the objection period ended on 10 February 2019.

Please find in the table below, a summary of the objections and the Council's response to those objections.

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections
1.	The Council has not consulted sufficiently in line with the 2013 School Organisation Code. Grŵp Rhiant a Phlentyn talwrn (Parent and Child group Talwrn) were not formally consulted because the children were not current pupils in Talwrn, they were not given a formal opportunity to respond as interested parties.	<p>The code states Parents and where possible "prospective parents "must be advised by letter or email of the availability of the consultation document.</p> <p>Parents were advised on the Councils behalf by the school about the availability of the consultation documents and the feedback form.</p> <p>The Council at the drop in sessions held (Ysgol Talwrn 16 May 2018) and through its own website and social media welcomed all comments from interested parties.</p> <p>The drop in sessions were publicised on the Councils Facebook and Twitter pages.</p>
2.	Pupil's opinion not taken into account as part of the consultation.	<p>Council officers visited Ysgol y Graig and Ysgol Talwrn as part of the consultation to gather pupil's views on the proposal.</p> <p>At both schools, the School Councils were consulted, and at Ysgol Talwrn at the request of parents, another group of children of different ages had the opportunity to contribute to the consultation further.</p> <p>Their comments were published in the report that went to the Executive on the 16 July 2018 and taken into consideration as part of the decision making process.</p>
3.	<p>The Number of pupils has increased from the consultation to 480 from 420 . This was not discussed or approved by The Executive. No authority to increase the capacity of Ysgol y Graig to 480.</p> <p>The school organisation code states that "where in the course of consultation, a new option emerges which the proposers decide</p>	<p>The pupil numbers of 420 (4-11 year old) does not include the nursery pupil numbers.</p> <p>As stated in the consultation document the nursery numbers as at January 2018 were Ysgol y Graig 52 and Talwrn 7, which is why the extended Ysgol y Graig will require a capacity of 480.</p> <p>This is therefore not a new option and does not require a fresh consultation.</p>

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections
	to pursue , they must consult afresh on this option before proceeding to publication”	
4.	Pupil numbers attending Ysgol Talwrn have increased since the consultation. January 2019 census indicates 45 children in attendance (capacity 49)	Even though the pupil numbers have increased, Ysgol Talwrn’s cost per pupil is still higher than Ysgol y Graig. Cost per head 2018/19 - Ysgol y Graig £3,369 and Ysgol Talwrn £4,571. The percentage of pupils attending Ysgol Talwrn from outside the Ysgol Talwrn catchment area has increased from 45% as at September 2017 to 53% as at September 2018 .
5.	Recent Estyn report for Ysgol Talwrn (October 2018) under a new Headteacher was good – why would you want to close the school?	In its summary of its response to the consultation, Estyn said: "Estyn is of the opinion that the proposal is likely to maintain the current standards of education in the area at least." In addition, the inspectorate considered that "the local authority has given a clear rationale for the intended expected benefits in relation to the current situation regarding finance, surplus places, and pupils’ standards, the quality of the learning environment and leadership and management. In addition, the proposer explains appropriately how the proposal matches the authority's 21st Century Schools program. The proposal clearly defines the intended benefits of the proposal, and these relate appropriately to the stated purpose and the rationale. The local authority has provided enough evidence to show that the scheme is at least likely to maintain an education standard in the area."
6.	Not fully complied with section 1.7 of the School organisation code 2013 as no material “identifying the overall effect of a closure on the local community ...particularly in rural areas” was included in the consultation.	The consultation document (1 May -18 June 2018) refers to housing developments, travelling and geographical factors and impact on the welsh language. https://www.anglesey.gov.uk/documents/Docs-en/Council/Consultations/2018/Talwrn/Statutory-Consultation-Documents---Llangefni-Area.pdf

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections
	During the consultation period , the council failed to attach either a Welsh Language risk assessment or a Community Impact Assessment as part of the consultation pack.	<p>The Corporate Scrutiny Committee on the 12 March 2018 states that “an impact assessment was conducted as part of the statutory consultation process. The possible effect of fulfilling the proposal on the Welsh language, equality and the community were assessed.)</p> <p>http://democracy.anglesey.gov.uk/documents/s12248/Schools%20Modernisation%20llangefni%20FINAL.pdf?LLL=0</p> <p>The full impact assessment(dated April 2018) was available with the report to the Executive dated 16 July 2018 : http://democracy.anglesey.gov.uk/documents/s12710/Schools%20Modernisation%20FINAL.pdf?LLL=0</p>
7.	Where the proposal involves increasing or reducing the capacity , the current number of pupils , the capacity of the school and the proposed capacity must be stated . Only the final capacity was noted on the Statutory notice.	<p>The statutory notice states the capacity of the expanded school will be 480. The notice incorporates both sections 42 and 43 of the School Standards and Organisation Act (Wales 2013). Section 43 refers to the proposals to discontinue a school , in this case Ysgol Talwrn , therefore it is not a requirement under the code to state the current number of pupils.</p>
8.	Implications on home to school transport provision- not stated in the statutory notice.	<p>The statutory notice refers the council's transport policy available at http://www.anglesey.gov.uk/education/schools/school-travel-support/</p>
9.	Arrangements for Transport – no confirmation that the Council will pay for school Transport for Talwrn pupils that live less than 2 miles to Ysgol y Graig.	<p>Arrangements for transport were noted in the consultation document 1 May 2018 - 18 June 2018 as follows :</p> <p>The LA (Local Authority) provides free transport for primary school pupils residing 2 miles or more from the school in whose catchment area they reside.</p> <p>The same policy also states: “transport is not provided for part time nursery pupils” and “The LA provides free transport for pupils under 16 as follows: a) For pupils who do not qualify for transport ... but who travel to school along a route that is considered by the County Council to be hazardous.”</p>
10.	Cost of purchasing land not presented to parents at consultation meetings	<p>This information was not available at the time and would not be publicly available information due to its commercial sensitivity.</p>

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections								
11.	The notice is illegal – and you should withdraw it.	Council Officer's through discussion with Welsh Government Officers received a letter giving the Council permission to re-issue the statutory notice for the purpose of clarity and a new time period was agreed. The statutory notice published on 14 January 2019 has as a result, been undertaken as per expectations and was checked by Councils Legal Officers prior to issuing.								
12.	Proposal does not address growing demand for school places as a result of the increased birth rate and future proposals for housing development in the Llangefni area.	The consultation document (1 May 2018 - 18 June 2018) addresses the demand for school places (page 12) and appendix 2, addresses housing developments in the area. https://www.anglesey.gov.uk/documents/Docs-en/Council/Consultations/2018/Talwrn/Statutory-Consultation-Document---Llangefni-Area.pdf								
13.	The Council have not adequately explored alternatives to closing Ysgol Talwrn such as merging with another similar size school, or federating with another school.	In Appendix 1 in the consultation document (1 May 2018-18 June 2018), 21 possible options for the area were considered , including the following in relation to Ysgol Talwrn: https://www.anglesey.gov.uk/documents/Docs-en/Council/Consultations/2018/Talwrn/Statutory-Consultation-Document---Llangefni-Area.pdf <table border="1" data-bbox="831 970 1886 1404"> <thead> <tr> <th>Idea</th> <th>Observations</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Have the Foundation Phase in Ysgol Talwrn for the 6 schools.</td> <td>Ysgol Talwrn's capacity is 49. A building would be needed for around 410 pupils for the Foundation Period only for the area's pupils.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Some thought that there was "land to build by Talwrn's village hall" and that there was a need for a 'breakdown' of cabin costs (£250k)</td> <td>The minimum size of this school would be 150 namely the size of Ysgol Rhyd y Llan and 5 acres are needed for the school. According to the Council's Property officers, there are no 5 acres available in the village.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>It was asked why Ysgol Llanbedrgoch was not part of this?</td> <td>Between the 2 schools, (Llanbedrgoch and Talwrn)there would be 70-80 pupils in the</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Idea	Observations	Have the Foundation Phase in Ysgol Talwrn for the 6 schools.	Ysgol Talwrn's capacity is 49. A building would be needed for around 410 pupils for the Foundation Period only for the area's pupils.	Some thought that there was "land to build by Talwrn's village hall" and that there was a need for a 'breakdown' of cabin costs (£250k)	The minimum size of this school would be 150 namely the size of Ysgol Rhyd y Llan and 5 acres are needed for the school. According to the Council's Property officers, there are no 5 acres available in the village.	It was asked why Ysgol Llanbedrgoch was not part of this?	Between the 2 schools, (Llanbedrgoch and Talwrn)there would be 70-80 pupils in the
Idea	Observations									
Have the Foundation Phase in Ysgol Talwrn for the 6 schools.	Ysgol Talwrn's capacity is 49. A building would be needed for around 410 pupils for the Foundation Period only for the area's pupils.									
Some thought that there was "land to build by Talwrn's village hall" and that there was a need for a 'breakdown' of cabin costs (£250k)	The minimum size of this school would be 150 namely the size of Ysgol Rhyd y Llan and 5 acres are needed for the school. According to the Council's Property officers, there are no 5 acres available in the village.									
It was asked why Ysgol Llanbedrgoch was not part of this?	Between the 2 schools, (Llanbedrgoch and Talwrn)there would be 70-80 pupils in the									

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections	
			school that is too small to attract finance. Federalizing the 2 schools would not address empty places or the condition of the buildings
		"If Ysgol Talwrn is closed, should the pupils be sent to Pentraeth?"	There is no room in Ysgol Pentraeth for Ysgol Talwrn pupils if Ysgol Talwrn closed
14.	Failure to comply with Regulation 48 , in that the Council have changed a key statutory driver mid-way through an extended notice period , without formally withdrawing the original notice and formally issuing a new statutory notice.	The notice issued 14 January 2019 superseded the previous notice issued on the 28 November 2018. Please see point 11.	
15.	Failure to comply with Section 49 "Objections must be sent in writing to the proposer before the end of the 28 days beginning with the day on which the proposals were published (the objection period). The objection period ended on Sunday (10/2/19), when the Council offices are closed for business and no postal service, therefore objectors have been given 27 days rather than 28 days to respond.	The code refers to objections must be made in writing or by email within 28 days of the date on which the proposal was published (the objection period). The code does not refer to 28 working days. Objectors in this case could email their objections up until the end of the objection period , or hand deliver their objections and post through the Council's letter box up until the end of the objection period.	
16.	Failure to publish a summary of objections made following the original statutory notice dated 28/11/18.	A summary of objections was not published following the original statutory notice 28/11/18, as the notice was re-issued on the 14/1/19 .Objections to the statutory notice together with the Councils response to be published by the 10 March 2019 and considered by the Council's Executive as part of the democratic decision making process.	

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections
17.	Parents concern of their child leaving a rural small school and attending a large town school and being unable to cope .	Measures will be put in place to ensure smooth transition by the large school in this case Ysgol y Graig. For example: pupils visits from the smaller school Ysgol Talwrn to Ysgol y Graig before transfer will take place as well as social events for pupil and parents from Ysgol Talwrn to visit Ysgol y Graig.
18.	Ysgol Talwrn staff raising concerns regarding their jobs in the future.	Staffing matters were addressed in the consultation document as follows : In line with statutory requirements, when a new school if formed, a Headteacher's post must be advertised openly. This would not be relevant in this case. For the rest of the staff, the Authority's advice to school governing bodies or school shadow governing bodies is to re-deploy staff from the school(s) that is/are closing to posts that become available in the new school to which pupils would be moving. In a situation where a school could close, the Authority's redundancy process would be involved. A Staffing Consultation Document would be prepared and meetings would be held with individual members of staff to ascertain if they wanted to remain as part of the process or not. It would be expected that the process would commence approximately 12/18 months prior to the official closing date of the school – this is done to give early assurance to staff about their employment and to allow them to make future plans.
19.	Disagree with the repair and maintenance costs published for Ysgol Talwrn in the consultation report.	The repair and maintenance costs were calculated by qualified surveyors, as is the case with all repair and maintenance costs across all Council assets.
20.	No explanation regarding the Governing body for the expanded Ysgol y Graig. Concern that there will be no representation from Ysgol Talwrn on the governing board.	The Council will consider either establishing a stakeholder engagement group or look to co-opt representatives from the Ysgol Talwrn area onto the Governing Body of Ysgol y Graig.
21.	The parking at Ysgol y Graig is dangerous.	A traffic impact assessment will be conducted and will address the issue of traffic

	Summary of Objections	The Council's response to the objections
		and parking around the school.
22.	Merge Ysgol Talwrn with Ysgol Llanbedrgoch would be a better option (two rural schools merging together)	Between Ysgol Talwrn and Ysgol Llanbedrgoch, there would be 70-80 (ages 3-11) pupils at school - the arrangement is still too small from a sustainability point of view. The federation of the 2 schools would not address surplus places or the condition of the buildings.
23.	The effect on Eisteddfod Talwrn if the school closes.	There are examples where the community continues to thrive in villages where the school has closed. Eisteddfodau continue in villages on Anglesey where there is no school e.g. Marianglas.